

UNAIDS ADVISORY GROUP ON HIV AND SEX WORK

Teleconferences 28 April 2011

Notes for Record (combined)

Co-Chairs: Jenny Butler (Senior Technical Advisor, UNFPA) (Calls 1&2) and Ruth Morgan Thomas (Interim Global Coordinator, NSWP) (Call 1).

Present:

Anna Torriente (UNAIDS - ILO) Call 1
Antonio Gerbase (UNAIDS - WHO) Call 1
Brianna Harrison – representing Mandeep Dhaliwal (UNAIDS - UNDP) Call 1
Dhianaraj Chetty - representing Chris Castle (UNAIDS - UNESCO) Call 1
Elena Reynaga (Latin America) Call 2
Iris Semini – representing David Wilson (UNAIDS – World Bank) Call 2
Jana Villayzan Aguilar (Independent – NSWP nominated Global Transgender Representative) Call 2
Jenny Butler (UNAIDS - UNFPA) Call 1 and 2
Joanne Csete (Independent – Columbia University) Call 2
Kataisee Richardson - representing Kieran Daly (Independent – ICASO) Call 2
Marie Denou (NSWP - Africa) Call 1
Nandinee Bandyopadhyay (Independent - PLRI) Call 1
Naomi Akers (NSWP – North America) Call 2
Riku Lehtovuori (UNAIDS - UNODC) Call 1
Ruth Morgan Thomas (NSWP – Europe) Call 1
Selvi Abdullah (NSWP – Asia Pacific) Call 1

Apologies:

Andrew Hunter (NSWP – Asia Pacific)
Els Klinkert (UNAIDS Secretariat)
Gabriela Leite (NSWP – Latin America)
Kyomya Macklean (NSWP - Africa)
Meena Seshu (Independent - SANGRAM)

Observers/Invited Experts:

Andy Seale (Global Fund – permanent observer) (Call 1)

In attendance:

Neil McCulloch (Advisory Group Secretariat) – notes
Debora Kayembe Miti (Translator / Interpreter - French)
Luján Patitucci (Translator / Interpreter – Spanish)

Welcome and Introductions

The co-chairs welcomed everyone to the meeting and noted the apologies, including Ruth for Call 2.

This is the first set of Teleconferences aimed at improving communication and maintaining momentum between face-to-face meetings. The co-chairs asked for members' patience as we try to identify and utilise new technologies and new ways of working to ensure the group's best possible functioning.

Updates from Co-chairs

UNAIDS Division of Labour

The Division of Labour has been revised with new responsibilities. UNFPA and UNDP co-convene the area on empowering men who have sex with men, sex workers and transgender people. UNESCO,

WHO, the World Bank, and the UNAIDS Secretariat are the partners. Many other areas of the Division of Labour are relevant to sex work including removing punitive laws, policies and practices (convened by UNDP), sexual transmission (co-convened by UNFPA and the World Bank), people who inject drugs (convened by UNODC), the world of work (convened by ILO), and treatment (convened by WHO).

UNAIDS Unified Budget, Results and Accountability Framework 2012-2015

This is the funding mechanism within the Joint UNAIDS Programme approved by the PCB. Two multi-stakeholder consultations have been held; Ruth Morgan Thomas participated in both. Men who have sex with men, sex workers, people who use drugs and transgender people are visible within the endorsed UNAIDS Strategy that guides the action of the UNAIDS Joint Cosponsored Programme.

Terminology issues have been raised in various fora, including by Ruth. One of the goals of the UNAIDS Strategy is to reduce sexual transmission by 50%, including among young people, men who have sex with men and in the context of sex work. The deliberately inclusive terminology of the goal has been replicated in a number of documents creating the impression of an emphasis on the context of sex work rather than on sex workers per se. There has been an agreement that the UNAIDS Secretariat will use the terminology of sex workers most of the time except when the context of sex work (sex workers, clients and other components of sex work) is the specific intention.

UN High Level Meeting on AIDS 2011

This meeting takes place in June and there will be sex work representatives from civil society from Asia Pacific (4), North America & the Caribbean (4), Mexico (2), REDLACTRANS and RedTraSex. Representation at this meeting will be critical.

Civil society organisations (including NSWAP, MSMGF and INPUD) issued a joint statement outlining principles and recommendations for addressing key populations - 10 Essential Steps for 'Getting to Zero'. Neil will circulate this statement. There is considerable concern that Member States will resist all efforts to specifically discuss sex workers, clients of sex workers, men who have sex with men, people who use drugs and transgender people. Recent meetings of the Commission on Population and Development and CEDAW evidenced considerable conservatism.

The Civil Society Informal Hearing was highly interactive bringing together civil society, major donors, governments and the United Nations. Sex worker representatives participated as members of panels and discussants from the floor.

Monitoring and Evaluation Operational Guidelines on Most at Risk Populations

Through a MERG initiated process, UNODC, UNDP, UNFPA, WHO, the UNAIDS Secretariat, GFATM, US Government, MEASURE at the University of North Carolina and ICASO to develop monitoring and evaluation operational guidance for implementation at the nation, sub national and local level. The guidelines aim to significantly improve the quality of the data collected on sex workers and clients, men who have sex with men, transgender people and people who use drugs. The current reliance on UNGASS data provides a completely inaccurate view of the HIV epidemic and response among key populations. Data from the 2010 UNGASS Reports, for instance, provide "evidence" that an average of 84% of sex workers from 59 countries are being reached by HIV prevention measures. The data can be interpreted to mean that universal in HIV prevention for sex workers has been reached – which is clearly not the case. Governments and the UN system rely on UNGASS

indicators. However, the data is flawed and often because the input data – that coming from the local and sub national levels is not strong or is not reflected in the national level compilation. The operational guidelines seek to improve the data quality at all three levels.

The operational guidelines for people who use drugs have been completed and released. The combined operational guidelines for men who have sex with men and sex workers and their clients are expected to be completed in 2011. These guidelines have been raised with the Advisory Group in previous meetings and will be shared in a draft form with the Advisory Group for input.

Revised UNGASS Indicators

Late last year UNFPA and the International AIDS Alliance led the process to review UNGASS HIV prevention indicators in a further attempt to improve the quality of UNGASS reports. Ruth, Jenny and Riku were involved in the revision process along with colleagues from UNDP and the GFATM. Despite agreement that the UNGASS indicators and descriptions are not robust the MERG did not agree to any major revision to the existing UNGASS data set. This is an area where continued advocacy is required; we need more reliable indicators that better reflect the reality on the ground.

WHO Guidelines development

WHO gave an update on progress since the presentation to the Advisory Group last year, including consultation with members of the Advisory Group, on how the guidelines can be developed into a comprehensive package for sex workers. This work will tie in very neatly with the World Bank work (below). The three systematic reviews will be finalised soon. NSWP is being contracted to undertake a consultation with sex workers to review the draft findings by the WHO consultants and a values and preferences survey.

World Bank Global Analysis of HIV in Sex Workers

The World Bank has commissioned a major analysis of the global epidemics of HIV in sex workers, examining the impact and cost-effectiveness of responding to the epidemic with evidence-based interventions, targeted to sex work. This major review and analysis of the evidence available will seek to identify the burden of HIV within countries that is borne by sex workers, examine the coverage of prevention, treatment and care for sex workers. It will also identify what constitutes a comprehensive package of evidence-based and human rights affirming services.

The AIDS Team at the World Bank will be working in partnership with UNFPA who have the lead role on sex work and HIV. UNFPA, NSWP and the World Bank will facilitate and conduct consultations with sex workers. NSWP, UNFPA, WHO and the UNAIDS Secretariat are members of the steering committee.

The Centre for Public Health and Human Rights (CPHHR), housed within the Johns Hopkins School of Public Health, were awarded the competitive tender: Dr Deanna Kerrigan is team leader.

The Terms of Reference of the World Bank analysis included sex workers of all genders and the World Bank confirmed that they are aware of the overlapping between MSM and transgender populations, and they would seek to include female, male and transgender sex workers in the review.

Current Advisory Group work – Annexes to the 2009 Guidance Note

Summary of progress to date

The co-chairs thanked everyone for their work on the Annexes so far, in particular the Working Group leads. It was acknowledged that getting the Annexes to this stage has been difficult and time-consuming. The documents have been through a content-editing process, then independently copy-edited by UNAIDS secretariat which caused some problems and the documents had to be revised again. The process tried to ensure everyone's input could be taken on board, however some of the reasons for the on-going delays could have been better communicated.

There was some discussion about using paid consultants for future papers. It was suggested that the Advisory Group members could work on the framework and content, then bring in paid consultants to draft the document.

UNDP sees a critical role for the Advisory Group in reviewing the implementation approaches emerging from the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) of the Global Commission on HIV and the Law.

Sign off tabled 3 Annexes and Introduction

Revision notes have been proposed on these drafts by Anna (ILO) and Andy (Global Fund). Other comments from Joanne and UNODC have already been incorporated.

There being no further comments, the 3 Annexes and the Introduction tabled will have the final adjustments made (above) and proceed for approval and publication by the Executive Director UNAIDS.

Process for agreeing Creating Enabling Legal and Policy Environments annexe

This paper is currently undergoing some final re-drafting. The draft will be sent out to the full Advisory Group for comment. It was noted that this is a short technical paper rather than a full analysis of the subject. When the Advisory Group meet in September we may consider producing a more complex and thorough document addressing how punitive laws, policies and practices can be removed.

Updates from AG members

Members of the group gave brief updates of significant developments from their region / organisations, including:

- UNDP reported that the Global Commission on HIV and the Law have carried out regional dialogues in the Caribbean, Asia Pacific and will have the dialogue in Eastern Europe and Central Asia in May 2011. Latin America dialogue is in June and the call for submissions for Africa hearing scheduled for 3-4 August 2011 (circulated on the listserv today). There will then be a dialogue for high income countries which may be held in the US in September / October. They are aware of the US travel restrictions for sex worker participation and will be looking into solutions. UNDP will ensure the Advisory Group is kept up to date with Global Commission developments
- Work in both NY and California to make it more difficult to use possession of condoms as evidence of engagement in sex work
- Work in California on anti-trafficking initiatives where under-17's (legally defined as trafficking victims) are incarcerated if they do not agree to testify against their exploiters

- In Argentina trafficking legislation continues to undermine the efforts of sex work organisations, AMMAR hope to present a law next year and a survey of 5000 sex workers, to the national parliament. This will be shared with the group when it is ready
- In Peru it is an electoral year and it is hoped that groups will be able to present amended legislation to the congress in August / September. It is also hoped to include training around harassment and human rights abuses of sex workers by law enforcement officers. Hoping to publish a survey of 500 sex workers showing high rates of HIV infection amongst trans sex workers

Advisory Group – ensuring robust working processes

The co-chairs are very committed to effective communications and working processes within the Advisory Group. These teleconferences are an attempt to strengthen information sharing and communications and maintain momentum between the annual face-to-face meetings. The co-chairs are also open to constructive and practical suggestions for ensuring the Advisory Group does the best possible job.

The Advisory Group does have a major role to play in influencing the international agenda, in many of the processes discussed on today's agenda e.g. the Global Commission on HIV and the Law.

Planning for September 2011 Advisory Group meeting

The proposed date for the next face-to-face Advisory Group meeting is 6th – 9th September. Tuesday 6th September would be a day for separate pre-meetings for both NSWP members and UN organisations. Following this there will be a 2 ½ day meeting of the full Advisory Group with an early finish on the Friday to allow for travel home.

UNESCO has offered to host the Advisory Group meeting at their headquarters in Paris.

From today's Teleconferences we already have suggestions for key issues for the agenda for that meeting as follows:

- UNGASS monitoring and evaluation Indicators and operational guidelines
- Anti-trafficking initiatives and their negative impacts on sex workers
- Detailed discussion on punitive laws, policies and practices with a view to producing a more comprehensive technical briefing paper.

Any further suggestions for other agenda items or thematic discussion areas for the meeting should be sent to Neil as soon as possible.

Date of Next Teleconference – w/c 11th July 2011

The next set of Teleconferences will be during the week commencing 11th July 2011. Neil will confirm the date and times by email in the near future. Any suggestions for agenda items should be sent to Neil. If people feel that 3 monthly Teleconferences are not enough then we can also consider increasing their frequency.